Working Group on Harvested Material and Unauthorized Use of **Propagating Material**

WG-HRV/7/3

Seventh Meeting Geneva, March 20, 2025 Original: English Date: July 23, 2025

REPORT

adopted by the Working group on harvested material and unauthorized use of propagating material

Disclaimer: this document does not represent UPOV policies or guidance

OPENING OF THE MEETING

- The Working Group on Harvested Material (WG-HRV) held its seventh meeting in Geneva, on March 20, 2025, in virtual format, chaired by Ms. Yolanda Huerta, Vice Secretary-General of UPOV.
- The Chair opened the meeting, welcoming the participants and the authors of the study commissioned to support the work of the WG-HRV.
- The Chair welcomed new participants to the WG-HRV and highlighted the participation of Nigeria as UPOV's 80th member, following its recent accession to the 1991 Act of the UPOV Convention.
- The Terms of Reference of the study approved by the WG-HRV, at its sixth meeting¹, are reproduced in Annex I and the list of participants is provided in Annex II to this report.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

5. The WG-HRV adopted the draft agenda as proposed in document WG-HRV/7/1.

REPORT ON THE PROGRESS MADE BY THE AUTHORS OF THE STUDY ON THE "SCOPE OF THE BREEDER'S RIGHT" AND THE RELATIONSHIP WITH THE "EXHAUSTION OF THE BREEDER'S RIGHT"

- 6. The Office of the Union provided background on the study, reiterating that the study was intended to support the work of the WG-HRV on explanatory notes concerning harvested material and the unauthorized use of propagating material, in line with the agreed terms of reference.
- 7. It was recalled that:
 - (a) The study should follow an independent academic approach.
 - The purpose of the study is to assist the WG-HRV and that UPOV members are not bound by the (b) content and/or conclusions drawn by the authors in the study.
 - (c) The report will be published on the UPOV website as a WG-HRV working document.
- Mr. Huib Ghijsen presented the progress made by the authors (presentation available on the UPOV website, under: https://www.upov.int/meetings/en/details.jsp?meeting_id=85866) and that he had been appointed as coordinator. He also informed that their meetings would continue regularly until the delivery of the report on September 1, 2025.

Held in Geneva on October 22, 2024.

- 9. Mr. Ghijsen emphasized that the authors were still in the early stages of research and coordination and that substantive conclusions had not yet been reached.
- 10. The Chair reminded participants of the background and rationale for the study, originating from challenges related to fruit trees and the relationship between Articles 14(2) and 16, which had been the focus of earlier seminars and working group discussions. The Office of the Union reported that the authors have declared, in the Progress Report of the Study (WG-HRV/7/2, Annex I), that they do not have a conflict to work on the Study. The Office will investigate whether there is a need for any further clarifications and possibly consult any practice of WIPO in that respect. The Chair reminded the participants and authors that the Terms of Reference (TORs) are clear and do not refer to interpretation, but to the analysis of the intentions of the drafters of the 1991 Act.
- 11. The Chair encouraged the authors to continue their internal coordination and to maintain consistency, while recognizing that including the authors' perspectives might enrich the analysis.

CONCLUSIONS

- 12. The main conclusions of the meeting are summarized below:
 - (a) The final version of the study is to be delivered on September 1st, 2025, as mentioned in the Terms of Reference. The Office of the Union will publish the study on its website as one of the documents to be considered at the eighth meeting of the WG-HRV, on October 22, 2025.
 - (b) The WG-HRV noted the progress made by the authors and took note of the structured approach and coordination in place to meet the study's objectives.
 - (c) The WG-HRV noted the authors' intention to first address Article 14 and then consider the relationship with Article 16, as outlined in the terms of reference.
 - (d) The WG-HRV reaffirmed that the study is to provide an analysis of the intentions of the drafters of the 1991 Act and that UPOV members are not bound by the content and/or conclusions drawn by the authors in the study.

DATE OF THE EIGHTH MEETING

13. The eighth meeting of the WG-HRV will take place in Geneva on Wednesday, October 22, 2025 (hybrid means), at a time to be announced.

[Annex I follows]

WG-HRV/7/3

ANNEX I

TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE STUDY ON THE "SCOPE OF THE BREEDER'S RIGHT" AND THE RELATIONSHIP WITH THE "EXHAUSTION OF THE BREEDER'S RIGHT"

SCOPE:

The study to include:

- a <u>first part</u> with an analysis of the intentions of the drafters of the 1991 Act of the UPOV Convention in relation to the "Scope of the Breeder's Right" in Article 14(1) and (2) of the 1991 Act, including the notions of "unauthorized use" and "reasonable opportunity" and the relationship with the "Exhaustion of the Breeder's Right" in Article 16 of the 1991 Act; and
- a <u>second part</u> with summaries of relevant court cases from UPOV members bound by the 1991 Act.

COMPOSITION:

The study should be carried out by the five authors mentioned below. The authors should agree on one of them to be coordinating their work.

The working language of the authors should be English and the study should be drafted in English.

Experts (alphabetic order)
Mr. Huib Ghijsen
Ms. Vivianne Kunisawa
Mr. Charles Lawson
Mr. Axel Metzger
Mr. Joseph Straus

MODUS OPERANDI:

Independence:

The authors are independent in drafting the study, in the sense that the authors should not receive individual instructions from anyone and that the authors should be impartial and objective.

The five authors should draft one study and should follow a collaborative working method following academic standards. Following such standards, the authors should manage potential different perspectives or analysis and, if applicable, how such matters should be reflected in the study.

Having received the study, it is up to the WG-HRV to consider a possible follow-up and to request further quidance from the CAJ, as appropriate.

UPOV members are not bound by the content and/or conclusions drawn in the study.

Timeline:

The authors will be asked to deliver the draft study by latest February 28, 2025, for consideration at the seventh meeting of the WG-HRV, expected to take place in Geneva on March 20, 2025. The final version of the study to be delivered by latest September 1st, 2025.

The time could be prolonged upon request by the authors.

WG-HRV/7/3 Annex I, page 2

Financial support:

55,000 Swiss Francs which would include:

- Honorarium of 10,000 Swiss francs for each of the 5 authors.
- Travel expenses up to 5,000 Swiss francs in total for the 5 authors. The purpose of the travel could be to
 convene a meeting amongst the authors or to support travel to come to Geneva to present the findings of
 the study or any other unforeseen travel expenses.

The overall estimation of the cost to be shared as follows: UPOV regular budget would cover 30,000 Swiss francs and the Funds-in-Trust Agreement between the Government of Japan and UPOV (JP-FIT) would cover 25,000 Swiss francs.

[Annex II follows]

WG-HRV/7/3

ANNEXE II / ANNEXII / ANEXO II

(dans l'ordre alphabétique des noms français des membres / in the alphabetical order of the French names of the members / por orden alfabético de los nombres en francés de los miembros)

I. MEMBRES / MEMBERS / MIEMBROS

ARGENTINE / ARGENTINA / ARGENTINA

María Laura VILLAMAYOR (Sra.), Coordinadora de Relaciones Institucionales e Interjurisdiccionales, Instituto Nacional de Semillas (INASE), Secretaría de Agricultura, Ganadería, Pesca y Alimentación, Buenos Aires

(e-mail: mlvillamayor@inase.gob.ar)

AUSTRALIE / AUSTRALIA / AUSTRALIA

Robyn ALLEN (Ms.), Policy Officer, IP Australia, Phillip

(e-mail: Robyn.Allen@IPAustralia.gov.au)

CHILI / CHILE / CHILE

Manuel Antonio TORO UGALDE (Sr.), Jefe Sección, Registro de Variedades Protegidas, Departamento de Semillas y Plantas, Servicio Agrícola y Ganadero (SAG), Santiago de Chile

(e-mail: manuel.toro@sag.gob.cl)

Felipe ARRIAGADA (Sr.), Profesional Registro de Variedades Protegidas, Ministerio de Agricultura, Santiago de Chile

(e-mail: felipe.arriagada@sag.gob.cl)

Alejandro Ignacio SAAVEDRA PÉREZ (Sr.), Profesional Registro de Variedades, Servicio Agrícola y Ganadero (SAG), Santiago de Chile (e-mail: alejandro.saavedra@sag.gob.cl)

CHINE / CHINA / CHINA

Yongqi ZHENG (Mr.), Director, Laboratory of Molecular Identification of Plant Varieties, Science and Technology Development Center (Office for Protection of New Varieties of Plant), National Forestry and Grassland Administration of China (NFGA), Beijing

(e-mail: zyq8565@126.com)

Yuxia LIU (Ms.), Consultant, Science and Technology Development Center, Office for Protection of New Varieties of Plants, National Forestry and Grassland Administration of China (NFGA), Beijing (e-mail: kjzxlyx@163.com)

Hua DENG (Ms.), Associate Researcher, Chinese Academy of Forestry, Beijing

(e-mail: denghua@caf.ac.cn)

Chuanhong ZHANG (Ms.), Research Professor, Research Institute of Forestry, Chinese Academy of Forestry. Beijing

(e-mail: zhangch@caf.ac.cn)

ESPAGNE / SPAIN / ESPAÑA

Cristina MARTÍNEZ SALAS (Ms.), Unit Head, Ministerio de Agricultura, Pesca y Alimentación (MAPA), Madrid

(e-mail: cmartinez@mapa.es)

ÉTATS-UNIS D'AMÉRIQUE / UNITED STATES OF AMERICA / ESTADOS UNIDOS DE AMÉRICA

Nyeemah GRAZIER (Ms.), Patent Attorney-Advisor, Office of Policy and International Affairs (OPIA), U.S. Department of Commerce, Alexandria

(e-mail: nyeemah.grazier@uspto.gov)

Christian HANNON (Mr.), Senior Patent Attorney, Office of Policy and International Affairs (OPIA), United States Patent and Trademark Office (USPTO), Alexandria

(e-mail: christian.hannon@uspto.gov)

Hasan AHMED (Mr.), Patent Attorney, Office of Policy and International Affairs (OPIA), U.S. Department of Commerce, Alexandria

(e-mail: hasan.ahmed@uspto.gov)

WG-HRV/7/3 Annex II, page 2

Jeffery HAYNES (Mr.), Commissioner, Plant Variety Protection Office, AMS, Science & Technology Program, United States Department of Agriculture (USDA), Washington D.C. (e-mail: Jeffery.Haynes@usda.gov)

FÉDÉRATION DE RUSSIE / RUSSIAN FEDERATION / FEDERACIÓN DE RUSIA

Anastasiia TOROPOVA (Ms.), Second Secretary, Permanent Mission, Genève (e-mail: toropovaaa1@yandex.ru)

JAPON / JAPAN / JAPÓN

Minori HAGIWARA (Ms.), Director for International Affairs on Plant Variety Protection, Plant Variety Protection Office, Intellectual Property Division, Export and International Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF), Tokyo

(e-mail: minori_hagiwara110@maff.go.jp)

Ryota KAJI (Mr.), Deputy Director, Intellectual Property Division, Export and International Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF), Tokyo

(e-mail: ryota_kaji430@maff.go.jp)

NIGÉRIA / NIGERIA / NIGERIA

Folarin OKELOLA (Mr.), Acting Registrar, Nigeria Plant Variety Protection Office, National Agricultural Seeds Council, Abuja

(e-mail: fspkelola@gmail.com)

NORVÈGE / NORWAY / NORUEGA

Ingrid Margrete GRONDAHL (Ms.), Senior Officer, Ministry of Agriculture, Oslo (e-mail: ingrid-margrete.grondahl@Imd.dep.no)

NOUVELLE-ZÉLANDE / NEW ZEALAND / NUEVA ZELANDIA

Christopher James BARNABY (Mr.), PVR Manager / Assistant Commissioner, Plant Variety Rights Office, Intellectual Property Office of New Zealand, Ministry of Economic Development, Christchurch (e-mail: Chris.Barnaby@pvr.govt.nz)

PAYS-BAS (ROYAUME DES) / NETHERLANDS (KINGDOM OF THE) / PAÍSES BAJOS (REINO DE LOS)

Bernadette REGEER (Ms.), Coordinating policy advisor, Phytosanitary Affairs and Propagating material, DG Agro & Nature, Ministry of Agriculture, Nature and Food Quality, Den Haag (e-mail: b.regeer@minlnv.nl)

RÉPUBLIQUE DE CORÉE / REPUBLIC OF KOREA / REPÚBLICA DE COREA

ChanWoong PARK (Mr.), Deputy Director/Examiner, Plant Variety Protection Division, Korea Seed and Variety Service (KSVS), Gyeongsangbuk-do

(e-mail: chwopark@korea.kr)

Kwanghong LEE (Mr.), Researcher, Korea Seed and Variety Service (KSVS), Maryang (e-mail: grin@korea.kr)

RÉPUBLIQUE TCHÈQUE / CZECH REPUBLIC / REPÚBLICA CHECA

Pavla BÍMOVÁ (Ms.), General affairs of DUS testing, National Plant Variety Office, Central Institute for Supervising and Testing in Agriculture (ÚKZÚZ), Brno (e-mail: pavla.bimova@ukzuz.gov.cz)

ROYAUME-UNI / UNITED KINGDOM / REINO UNIDO

Kat DEEKS (Ms.), Plant Variety and Seeds Policy Team Leader, Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra), Cambridge

(e-mail: katherine.deeks@defra.gov.uk)

Sigurd RAMANS-HARBOROUGH (Mr.), Manager of UK Variety Listing and PBR, Plant Varieties and Seeds, Animal and Plant Health Agency (APHA), Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA), Cambridge

(e-mail: Sigurd.Ramans-Harborough@defra.gov.uk)

Miranda REYNOLDS-WRIGHT (Ms.), Senior Policy Officer of the Plant Varieties and Seeds, Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, Cambridge

 $(e\hbox{-mail: Miranda.Reynolds-Wright@defra.gov.uk})$

WG-HRV/7/3 Annex II, page 3

UNION EUROPÉENNE / EUROPEAN UNION / UNIÓN EUROPEA

Päivi MANNERKORPI (Ms.), Team Leader - Plant Reproductive Material, Unit G1 Plant Health, Directorate General for Health and Food Safety (DG SANTE), European Commission, Brussels (e-mail: paivi.mannerkorpi@ec.europa.eu)

Spyridon FLEVARIS (Mr.), Policy Officer, Plant Health Unit, European Commission - Health and Food Safety Directorate-General - Directorate Crisis preparedness in food, animals and plants, Brussels (e-mail: spyridon.flevaris@ec.europa.eu)

Nuria URQUÍA FERNÁNDEZ (Ms.), Vice President, Community Plant Variety Office (CPVO), Angers (e-mail: urquia@cpvo.europa.eu)

Jean MAISON (Mr.), Head of Unit ad interim, Plant Variety Expertise Unit, Community Plant Variety Office (CPVO), Angers

(e-mail: maison@cpvo.europa.eu)

Alexandre CHRIST (Mr.), Legal Advisor, Community Plant Variety Office (CPVO), Angers (e-mail: christ@cpvo.europa.eu)

II. ORGANISATIONS / ORGANIZATIONS / ORGANIZACIONES

ASSOCIATION FOR PLANT BREEDING FOR THE BENEFIT OF SOCIETY (APBREBES)

François MEIENBERG (Mr.), Coordinator, Association for Plant Breeding for the Benefit of Society (APBREBES), Zürich, Suisse (e-mail: contact@apbrebes.org)

ASSOCIATION INTERNATIONALE DES PRODUCTEURS HORTICOLES (AIPH) / INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF HORTICULTURAL PRODUCERS (AIPH) / ASOCIACIÓN INTERNACIONAL DE PRODUCTORES HORTÍCOLAS (AIPH)

Mia HOPPERUS BUMA (Ms.), Secretary, Committee for Novelty Protection, International Association of Horticultural Producers (AIPH), The Hague, Netherlands (Kingdom of the) (e-mail: info@miabuma.nl)

COMMUNAUTÉ INTERNATIONALE DES OBTENTEURS DE PLANTES HORTICOLES À REPRODUCTION ASEXUÉE (CIOPORA) / INTERNATIONAL COMMUNITY OF BREEDERS OF ASEXUALLY REPRODUCED HORTICULTURAL PLANTS (CIOPORA) / COMUNIDAD INTERNACIONAL DE FITOMEJORADORES DE PLANTAS HORTÍCOLAS DE REPRODUCCIÓN ASEXUADA (CIOPORA)

Edgar KRIEGER (Mr.), Secretary General, International Community of Breeders of Asexually Reproduced Horticultural Plants (CIOPORA), Hamburg, Germany

(e-mail: edgar.krieger@ciopora.org)

Micaela FILIPPO (Ms.), Vice Secretary-General, International Community of Breeders of Asexually Reproduced Horticultural Plants (CIOPORA), Hamburg, Germany

(e-mail: micaela.filippo@ciopora.org)

Thomas LEIDEREITER (Mr.), Legal Expert, Representative, Green Rights Law Firm, Hamburg, Allemagne (e-mail: leidereiter@green-rights.com)

CROPLIFE INTERNATIONAL

 $\label{lem:marcel-BRUINS} \mbox{ (Mr.), Consultant, CropLife International, Bruxelles, Belgique (e-mail: marcel@bruinsseedconsultancy.com)}$

EUROSEEDS

Francesca GARBATO (Ms.), Manager, Intellectual Property & Legal Affairs, Euroseeds, Bruxelles, Belgique (e-mail: francescagarbato@euroseeds.eu)

SEED ASSOCIATION OF THE AMERICAS (SAA) / ASOCIACIÓN DE SEMILLAS DE LAS AMÉRICAS (SAA)

Diego A. RISSO DESIRELLO (Mr.), Director Ejecutivo, Seed Association of the Americas (SAA), Montevideo, Uruguay

(e-mail: drisso@saaseed.org)

Marymar BUTRUILLE (Ms.), Germplasm IP Scientist Lead, Bayer Crop Science, Ankeny (e-mail: marymar.butruille@bayer.com)

WG-HRV/7/3 Annex II, page 4

III. AUTEURS / AUTHORS / AUTORES

Huib GHIJSEN (Mr.), Advisor, Middleburg

(e-mail: huibghijsen@gmail.com) Viviane KUNISAWA (Ms.), Lawyer

(e-mail: viviane.kunisawa@daniel-ip.com)

Charles LAWSON (Mr.), Associate Professor, Griffith Law School, Griffith University, Brisbane, Australie

(e-mail: c.lawson@griffith.edu.au)

Joseph STRAUS (Mr.), Executive Director, Max-Plank-Institut für ausländisches und internationales Patent-,

Urheber- und Wettbewerbsrecht, Munich, Allemagne

(e-mail: j.straus@ip.mpg.de)

IV. BUREAU / OFFICER / OFICINA

Yolanda HUERTA (Ms.), Chair

V. BUREAU DE L'UPOV / OFFICE OF UPOV / OFICINA DE LA UPOV

Yolanda HUERTA (Ms.), Vice Secretary-General
Martin EKVAD (Mr.), Director of Legal Affairs
Leontino TAVEIRA (Mr.), Director of Global Development and Technical Affairs
Yoshiro NISHIMURA (Mr.), Technical/Regional Officer (Asia)

[Fin du document/ End of document/ Fin del documento]